

This isn't JJ hostel, welcome to KEM nursing quarters

Concrete slab falls on cook at the Parel building; mid-day finds cracks, exposed rods everywhere

SURAJ PANDEY

suraj.pandey@mid-day.com

A 40-YEAR-old woman suffered grievous head injuries after a concrete slab fell from the roof at the KEM Nurses Quarters and School of Nursing in Parel on Thursday. This is not a one-off mishap at the 3-storey building as every corner of the structure has turned precarious for want of repairs. The nursing students said they constantly live in fear and that authorities have done nothing to ensure their safety.

Sangeeta Chavan, who works as a cook, got a deep gash on her head.

The nursing students are attached to the King Edward Memorial Hospital and Seth Gordhandas Sunderdas Medical College which are among Mumbai's prestigious institutions. Their nursing school and hostel building is about 96 years old. mid-day visited the premises



The place where the concrete slab fell on the cook at KEM Nurses Quarters and School of Nursing in Parel; plaster fallen off the roof

on Thursday with the help of former corporator Anil Kokil. The nutritional lab is so rickety that it is closed. Students are forced to do their academic work in the kitchen. The bathroom walls have turned green due to leakage. Chunks of plaster have come off at several places exposing the rusted iron rods.

While cracks can be seen almost everywhere, iron scaffolding have been put up to prevent beams from collapsing. The condition of this Parel hostel is worse than that of the JJ hospital resident doctors' hostel at Byculla that mid-day had earlier exposed. It had prompted the state human rights commission to heavily censure the authorities.

"Concrete chunks are falling every now and then. A few months ago, a ceiling fan came crashing down along with a huge piece of mortar slab. Luckily, no one was injured. If anything happens to the students or staff who will be responsible," asked a nursing student requesting anonymity.

Ex-corporator Kokil, who also went around the building with the hospital's acting dean Harish Pathak, told mid-day, "For the past one and half years, I've been following up on this issue with the BMC's civil department. They inspected the place but no steps were taken to resolve the issue. After today's incident, now they are saying that they will float a tender for the repairs. My question is what are they waiting for? Are they waiting for someone to die? I have

already written to dean Dr Sangeeta Rawat and if no steps are taken then I will ask the additional municipal commissioner to visit the hostel."

Sources said after a structural audit in 2018, the building was declared C2 category—it needs major repairs. While yearly structural audits are a must for buildings older than 30 years, it has not been done for the nursing school and hostel since then.

Dr Rawat, the dean, said, "I'm out of the station, contact Dr Harish Pathak, acting dean."

Additional Municipal Commissioner Dr Sanjeev Kumar told mid-day, "Immediate steps will be taken for the repair work and we will also conduct a structural audit." About no structural audit since 2018, he said, "An inquiry will be conducted and we will take action against the responsible person."



पुढारी 4-11-2022

पुढारी my Page 1

केईएममध्ये स्लॅब कोसळले!

४० वर्षीय नर्स जखमी; रुग्णालयाचे नर्सस निवासस्थान झाले धोकादायक

मुंबई : पुढारी वृत्तसेवा

मुंबई पालिकेच्या परळ येथील के. ई. एम. हॉस्पिटलच्या आवारातील नर्सस सेवा निवासस्थान धोकादायक बनली आहेत. गुरुवारी सकाळी साडेनऊच्या सुमारास खोलीमधील स्लॅब कोसळून जेवण बनवत असलेल्या योगिता चव्हाण (४०) या नर्स किरकोळ जखमी झाल्या. त्यांची अन्यत्र तात्पुरती व्यवस्था केली आहे.

● के. ई. एम. हॉस्पिटलच्या आवारातील नर्सिंग सेवा निवासस्थानाची होणारी पडझड लक्षात घेऊन, दुरुस्तीचे काम लवकरच हाती घेण्यात येणार असल्याचे हॉस्पिटल प्रशासनाकडून सांगण्यात आले. केईएम हॉस्पिटलच्या आवारात नर्सिंग व अन्य शिक्षण घेण्यासाठी येणाऱ्या मुला मुलींसाठी वस्तीगृह इमारत आहे. तीन मजली असलेल्या या इमारतीचे अलीकडेच स्ट्रक्चरल ऑडिट करण्यात आले होते. यात ही इमारती धोकादायक असल्याचे दिसून आले. परंतु सल्लागारांनी या इमारतीची दुरुस्ती केल्यास त्यांचे आयुर्मान दहा ते बारा वर्षांनी वाढू शकेल, असा अहवाल दिला. त्यानुसार पालिकेने या इमारतीची संरचनात्मक दुरुस्ती करण्याचा निर्णय घेतला असल्याचे प्रशासनाकडून सांगण्यात आले.

के. ई. एम. हॉस्पिटलमधील नर्सस सेवानिवासस्थान १९२६ मध्ये बांधण्यात आली होती. सुमारे ९६ वर्ष जुन्या असलेल्या या इमारतीची डागडुजी अधूनमधून केली जात होती. पण गेल्या काही वर्षांपासून या निवासस्थानाची डागडुजी करण्यात आलेली नाही. त्यामुळे या इमारती धोकादायक बनल्या आहेत. काही दिवसांपूर्वी एका खोलीमधील स्लॅबसह पंख्यापासून काही नर्सस जखमी झाल्या होत्या.

गुरुवारी सकाळी साडेनऊच्या सुमारास अचानक एक स्लॅब कोसळला. त्यावेळी योगिता चव्हाण या जेवण बनवत होत्या. त्यामुळे त्यांना किरकोळ दुखापत झाली आहे.

या दुर्घटनेनंतर तातडीने स्थानिक माजी नगरसेवक अनिल कोकीळ यांनी के. ई. एम. हॉस्पिटलला भेट देऊन, दुर्घटनेची पाहणी केली. नर्सस सेवानिवासस्थान धोकादायक बनल्याचे प्रशासनाला अनेकदा सांगूनही त्यांच्याकडून कानाडोळा केला जात असल्याचा आरोप यावेळी कोकीळ यांनी केला.



मुंबई : स्लॅब कोसळल्याने जेवण बनवत असलेल्या नर्स जखमी झाल्या. त्यांच्या मानेला दुखापत झाली आहे. स्थानिक माजी नगरसेवक अनिल कोकीळ यांनी के. ई. एम. हॉस्पिटलला भेट देत पाहणी केली. नर्सस निवासस्थान धोकादायक बनले असून प्रशासनाचे दुर्लक्ष होत असल्याचा आरोप त्यांनी केला.



MAHARASHTRA STATE HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION

9, Hajarimal Somani Marg, Opp. Chhatrapati Shivaji Maharaj Terminus, Mumbai – 400 001

Tel : 22092857 Email:- court1-mshrc@mah.gov.in

KKT/Suo Moto Case No.- 434413/16 /2022

Name of Respondent : The Municipal Commissioner
Municipal Corporation of Greater Mumbai
Mumbai

The Dean
KEM Hospital
Mumbai

Date : 4th November 2022

Coram : Justice K.K. Tated, Chairperson

PROCEEDING

Not on board. Taken on board.

2. We noticed news appeared in Mid Day English News paper, Pudhari Marathi News Paper, Nav Bharat Times Hindi New Paper and Lokmat Marathi News Paper dated 04.11.2022 stating that Municipal Corporation of Greater Mumbai failed and neglected to maintain Nursing Quarters at KEM Hospital. It is stated in the said news that the building of the Hostel is 96 years old which was constructed in 1926 and near about 300 nursing students occupying the same. In spite of several complaints / requests Corporation failed and neglected to carry out the repairs. Not only that the Corporation failed to carry out the structural audit from 2018 of the said building.

3. Considering these facts the following order is passed:

- a) Office is directed to issue summons to the Municipal Commissioner, Municipal Corporation of Greater Mumbai and Dean, KEM Hospital, Mumbai calling upon them to affidavit in reply before this Commission on or before 11.11.2022 on following points:

9

- i. How many students are occupying the Nursing Quarters at KEM Hospital, Mumbai?
 - ii. How many rooms are there?
 - iii. Since 2000 how many times structural audit is done of the said structure, as and when the repair work done by the Corporation of the said structure
 - iv. Is there any complaint received from the occupants for carrying out the repairs of the said building.
 - v. Whether office of the Dean, KEM Hospital informed to the Municipal Corporation of Greater Mumbai for carrying out the repairs, if yes, place on record copies of those letters?
 - vi. Any action is taken by the Municipal Corporation of Greater Mumbai on letters of KEM Hospital for carrying out repairs?
 - vii. Within how much time Municipal Corporation of Greater Mumbai is going to carry out the structural as well as tenantable repairs of the said building?
 - viii. What arrangement they are going to make of all occupants during the period of repairs?
- b) Matter to appear on board before Division Bench of Justice K.K. Tated, Chairperson and Shri. Bhagwantrao D. More, Member in Court No.1 on 11th November 2022 at 11.00 a.m.


(Justice K. K. Tated)
Chairperson



MAHARASHTRA STATE HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION

9, Hajarimal Somani Marg, Opp. Chhatrapati Shivaji Maharaj Terminus, Mumbai – 400 001

Tel : 22092857 Email : court1-mshrc@mah.gov.in

DIVISION BENCH **Suo Motu Case No.– 4344/13/16/2022**

Name of Respondent : Municipal Commissioner
Municipal Corporation of Greater
Mumbai, Mumbai

Dean,
KEM Hospital,
Mumbai

Date : 08th May 2023

Coram : Justice K.K. Tated, Chairperson
M.A.Sayeed, Member

ORDER

(Per: M. A. Sayeed, Hon'ble Member)

An alarming news about the pathetic status of the nursing quarters at KEM hospital came to be reported in English newspaper 'Midday', Marathi and Hindi newspapers 'Pudhari', 'Lokmat' and 'Navbharat Times' dated 04.11.2022. It is further reported that the nurses hostel building was more than 96 years old, with an occupancy of about 300 nursing students and despite repeated request to corporation for carrying out necessary renovation, neither any steps came to be taken nor any structural audit report was obtained since 2018.

2. Considering the gravity of the news article suo motu cognizance u/s. 12 of the Act of 1993 came to be taken by the Commission and notices were issued to the Corporation.

3. Reports on affidavits came to be submitted at Ex. 'A' to 'C'. During course of enquiry Ld. Law Asst Valvi for Corporation and Dean, KEM Hospital made a candid submission at Bar that steps are been taken to make temporary transit accommodation for the nursing staff as the building required major repairs and renovation. Accordingly, in consonance with our direction dated 02.05.2023, report on affidavit Ex. 'D' dated 04.05.2023 came to be placed by Dr. Sangeeta Rawat, Dean, (GSMC and KEM Hospital) affirming in paras 3 to 6 as under:

"3. I say that, as stated in the previous affidavit, the administration has now identified a vacant Municipal School in vicinity of KEM Hospital as an alternative location for shifting. The Administrative approval is received for the handing over of the said school building and KEM hospital has received the possession of the building. Since the school building was unoccupied for last 2 to 3 years, some civil and other routine maintenance is required before shifting the students. The tendering process for the said work is in progress.

4. I say that, in addition to this, the administration has decided to shift some students to Nurses quarter building which is presently in possession of KEM Hospital where some minor repairs are being carried out by Health Infrastructure cell of BMC.

5. I say that, the occupants of the Nurses quarter & School of Nursing will be shifted in the Municipal School and Nurses quarter building immediately after

the repairs are completed in phase wise manner. The shifting process will take at least 3 months to complete.

6. I say that, in the meantime, KEM Hospital and BMC administration is taking all the measures to ensure the safety of Nursing students and other occupants in this dilapidated building of School of Nursing and Nurses quarter in the premises of KEM hospital. Preventive maintenance such as providing props at required location, providing safety nets at required location, removing loose plaster etc is in place, in consultation with the structural consultant."

4. Thus, with such concrete steps taken by the corporation in coordination with the Dean, we are of the opinion that no further intervention by the Commission is required, since the issue has been resolved. Accordingly following order:

"ORDER"

a) The present Suo Motu stands closed and disposed off with no order as to cost.

Sd/-

(M.A. Sayeed)
Member

sd/-

(Justice K. K. Tated)
Chairperson